

National Report on the quality situation in guidance in group settings in TURKEY

Project manager: Mehtap Bahadir

Authors: Ilkay SAVCI

Project: GuideMe!
www.guideme.at

Due on: January 15, 2010

ABBREVIATIONS

VET: Vocational Education and Training

ISKUR: Turkish Employment Organization

MoNE: Ministry of National Education

MsLSS: Ministry of Labor and Social Security

ALMP: Active Labor Market Programmes

TISK: Turkish Employers' Union Confederation

MYK: Vocational Qualification Authority

RAM: Guidance and Research Centers

TURK-IS: Turkish Employees' Union Confederation

IKDAM: Ankara University Center for the Study of Human Resources
Management and Career Counseling

MTEM: Modernization of Vocational and Technical Education and Training

TOBB: The Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of Turkey

BEGEV: Bursa the Foundation for Developing Education

TQM: Total Quality Management

PDR-DER: Turkish Psychological Counseling and Guidance Association

TSE: Turkish Standards Institution

1 Offer in scope of guidance in group setting measures in Turkey

The first step of vocational education and training (VET) and guidance in group setting was taken in 1950s as activities of "psychological counseling and vocational guidance", and then these works have gradually been developed and generalized in due course. Today new regulations have been implemented in scopes such as education, employment, law, etc. in the process of accession to European Union - EU and in the framework of adaptation to EU *acquis communautaire*. One of those regulations is in the scope of VET and guidance in which the efforts of institutions of public and private sectors, and of civil society have been transformed into collaboration. There are employee/employer organizations, chambers, municipalities, institutions of local administration, and other civil society organizations among those institutions. Yet the activities of VET and guidance are majorly performed by the following two institutions. One of them is Turkish Employment Organization (ISKUR) affiliated to Ministry of Labor and Social Security (MoLSS) and the other is Ministry of National Education (MoNE).

ISKUR is the institution that fulfils the most comprehensive activities related to unemployment, job search-placement, job advertisement, evaluations of labor market, delivering courses of VET, private employment agencies, active labor market programs (ALMPs), and vocational counseling. It is the unemployed persons, job seekers, disabled people, women, youngsters and prisoners/ex-prisoners that ISKUR offers service as target groups. The institution is also the main actor collaborating with a variety of organizations and foundations in society on its subject and takes place in lots of projects as a partner¹.

Responsible of pre-school, primary and secondary education MoNE is the institution that presents guidance service for youngsters and children at the primary and secondary school age in order to guide them according to their skills and interests.

¹ www.iskur.gov.tr/LoadExternalPage.aspx?uicode=statisgucuyetistirmekursl (Mesleki Eğitim Kursları ve İşgücü Uyum Hizmetleri, Febr.09.2010)

MONE conducts the vocational courses for young people, women and prisoners/ex-prisoners through the Education Center for Apprenticeship and Education Center for Public affiliated to MONE General Directorate of Apprenticeship and Non-formal Education as well.

Both of these institutions continue the activities of both individual counseling and guidance in group setting.

1.1 Initiators of guidance measures

Comprehensive information about ISKUR and MONE, which undertake the major tasks of vocational training and group counseling, is chronologically subsumed in "The Country Report of Vocational Information, Career Guidance and Counseling in Turkey". As it is clear from the report, the activities of VET and guidance has increasingly come into prominence on the topic of education and employment. The activities implemented by these institutions are summed up in the report as follows² :

Turkish Employment Organization (ISKUR), which is the relevant institution of MoLSS, was founded in 1946 and restructured in 2003 as ISKUR. Today there are 108 local offices of ISKUR whose center is located in Ankara. 81 of those local offices are in provinces and the rest is in districts. The total number of personnel working in the institution is 2502³. The number of workforce registered in the institution has reached 1.886.072 in January of 2010 with an increase of 700.447 persons regarding previous year. The number of open jobs has increased 174,38% in respect to the same period of the last year. The number of job placement has showed an increase at the rate of 65, 73% in January of 2010 in respect to the same period of the last year⁴.

ISKUR has been implementing some of its activities online and some via individual or group settings. It is possible to divide these services into three

² Füsün Akkok, The Country Report of Vocational Information, Career Guidance and Counseling in Turkey. (unpublished document) ISKUR, Ankara, (Turkey), 2006, p. 11-13.

³ http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/rapor_bulten/2009_2011donemi_performans_programi.pdf (2009-2011 Performance Programme Report, Febr.14, 2010)

⁴ <http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/ark/ark/ocak.htm> (January 2010 Statistics Bulletin, Feb.09, 2010)

groups. The first is to place the job seekers in available positions. The job seekers can find information about available positions from the website of ISKUR and make an online application. The second is that one can obtain information such as personal advices, information of labor market, insurance benefits of unemployment from website as well. The last service is job counseling and vocational training. ISKUR was founded by adapting the model of German Employment Organization and Work and Job Counseling as an example between the years 1992-1994. The unit of Job counseling and Services of Vocational Guidance was founded for this end. Starting at five provinces in 1992, the job and vocational counseling services have been increasingly become widespread.

The services of work and job counseling of ISKUR exist in 43 Centers for Vocational Guidance in 40 directorates of provinces and 19 the Services of Job and Vocational Guidance in 17 directorates of provinces. ISKUR has undertaken the Euroguidance in 2009 and conducted the activities of guidance rightly according to the perspective of life-long learning in the framework of national and international co-operation. In this context it carries on close collaboration with universities so as to increase the use of PLOTEUS portal. As an activity of Center for Vocational Guidance, 804 students and 122 instructors in all provinces have made individual applications in January of 2010. While the number of group application by the schools and private education centers is 2146, the number of application as an institution is 16.⁵

One of the most remarkable activities of ISKUR is vocational courses which are implemented within the framework of active employment policies. Active Labor Market Policies-1 (ALMP-1) Programme, consisting of vocational training and guidance services in group settings, was implemented between 2004 and 2006.

⁵ http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/ark/ark/ocak_dosyalar/20.pdf (Center for Vocational Guidance Activity Report. Febr.09.02.2010)

It According to the findings of social impact research based on ALMP-1⁶ it was decided that ALMP-2 be implemented in 28 provinces and the target groups comprise of unemployed women and youngsters.⁷ "Supporting Women in Entering Labor Markets Project" financed by IPA aims at delivering entrepreneurship trainings for 4000 women, childcare and elderly care trainings for 1200 women. 12.000 women will benefit from employment guaranteed courses within the project. Moreover, it is expected that 18.000 women will benefit from counseling and guidance services.⁸

As a group activity 897 employment guaranteed courses were organized between 1992 and 2008 within "Vocational Education and Training Courses and Services for Workforce Adaptation" in ISKUR. As a result, 24648 persons received training. 494 courses were organized for 8535 persons who want to launch their own business. These courses cover "workforce trainings", "vocational training and rehabilitation of disabled people, prisoners and ex-prisoners", "entrepreneurship trainings", "probation programs", "working programs for public good", "vocational training of working people".⁹

ISKUR collaborates with different institutions and organizations particularly in the EU participation process. Except for its core activities about vocational counseling, ISKUR implemented the "Collaboration Protocol for Vocational Guidance and Counseling" with MONE, MoLSS, ISKUR and Turkish Employers' Union Confederation (TİSK) between the years 1992 and 2004. Another joint activity is "Developing National Policies and Implementations of Vocational Guidance Services Workshop" first held in 2004. In these workshops,

⁶ R.Varcin, B.Gulçubuk, I.Savci, G.Ergun ve Duman, Şirin A. Active Labor Market Project New Opportunities Programme: Programme Evaluation Report, ETF, 2007.([www.etf.europa.eu/Web.nsf/0b48b8b071a6e703c1002fa98d/35a6da974e7081bc125728f002ada03/\\$FILE/ALMP_Report%202007.pdf](http://www.etf.europa.eu/Web.nsf/0b48b8b071a6e703c1002fa98d/35a6da974e7081bc125728f002ada03/$FILE/ALMP_Report%202007.pdf))

⁷ http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/rapor_bulten/2009_2011donemi_performans_programi.pdf (2009-2011 Performans Programı Raporu, Febr. 14, 2010)

⁸ ibid. p.49

⁹ www.iskur.gov.tr/LoadExternalPage.aspx?uicode=statisgucuyetistirmekursl (Mesleki Eğitim Kursları ve İşgücü Uyum Hizmetleri, Febr.09.2010)

improvements, problems, resolutions on the activities of vocational training are handled.

ISKUR determined 250 occupational standards between 1995 and 2000. These occupational standards have been compiled as a guide book and CDs and made available to various institutions as well as being available on ISKUR's web page. Founded in 2006 as a relevant institution of MoLSS, "Vocational Qualification Authority (MYK)" subsequently collected all occupational standards in a single data pool. MYK has begun the preparations to establish "The Centers for Developing Vocational Qualification Standards and Measuring-Assessing Knowledge and Skill". It is anticipated that the related institutions to contribute the formation of these centers are supported by donation.¹⁰

ISKUR has been implementing many projects on vocational guidance, training and employment financed by EU. Moreover, it provides information and application services on phone by its "180 Job Counseling Phone Service".

As we stated before, MONE has the responsibility to implement primary and secondary education. MONE also performs the activities of vocational information and guidance through "Guidance and Research Centers (RAM)" affiliated to the ministry. "The Component of Vocational Guidance and Counseling" has been formed as a part of Secondary Education Strengthening Project financed by World Bank between the years 2006 and 2010. The project aims at improving the sources of vocational information and institutional co-operation on vocational guidance and counseling and increasing the quality of personnel and school applications.

Another project implemented by the MONE is "The Strengthening Vocational Education and Training Project" financed by EU, TISK and Turkish Employees' Union Confederation (TURK-IS). Within the framework of lifelong learning, the project aims at introducing and improving the strategic importance of information on labor markets and jobs in developing human resources quality of

¹⁰www.myk.gov.tr (Genel Olarak, Jan.20, 2010)

the country. The standards of 65 occupations have been defined and uploaded to the internet¹¹.

The occupational quality standards will be formed by defining these job standards. It is clear that this activity is to bring standardization and quality to vocational guidance services. The existence of these efforts focuses on updating and improving of the efficiency of vocational training and of vocational guidance. However, that the job standards have not been defined so far prevents many arrangements to be successful in Turkey.¹²

1.2 Organizations carrying out the training measures

The activities of VET and guidance are mostly carried out by MONE and ISKUR. However, universities, private sector, employee-employer trade unions, charitable foundations, trade chambers and associations participate in the activities as partners or training institutions.

Among those institutions there are universities, which are considered as institutions traditionally producing academic knowledge and operating in the area of conveying produced knowledge. However, the changing world makes it difficult for the universities to remain in this traditional structure. Therefore, the concepts of transition from school to labor market and lifelong learning have been a new area of concern for universities. While the increasing number of universities and also of students get institutions create a competitive environment for universities, which also makes it harder for students to get into labor market. From this point of view, universities are leaning towards activation programs by organizing their structures in terms of vocational training and guidance. They also play an active role in those programs as a

¹¹ www.megep.meb.gov.tr (index, Febr.03, 2010)

¹² Fidan Korkut. "Psikolojik Danışmanların Mesleki Rehberlik ve Psikolojik Danışmanlık ile İlgili Düşünceler ve Uygulamaları". Hacettepe Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Fakültesi Dergisi. vo.32, 2007; Metin Piskin: "Türkiye'de Psikolojik Danışma ve Rehberlik Hizmetlerinin Dünü, Bugünü ve Yarını". Muhsin Hesapçoğlu ve Alpaslan Durmuş (Ed.). Türkiye'de Eğitim Bilimleri: Bir Bilanço Denemesi. Ankara, (Turkey), 2006.

partner and also with their academic staff. On the other hand universities have been establishing career guidance and vocational training centers preparing the students for employment and setting certification programs for vocational training.

The first example of providing vocational guidance and career counseling at university level is foundation of Ankara University Center for the Study of Human Resources Management and Career Counseling (IKDAM) in 2004. IKDAM has launched a master programme in Human Resources Management and Career Counseling.¹³ IKDAM has been implementing national and international projects carried on vocational training and career counseling. For instance, Job-Clup /Vocational Guidance and Career Counseling Project (MEKDAM) was financed by EU and implemented by İKDAM and ASO. Ankara Industrial Vocations Inventory was prepared and Job Club was established. Another project carried out by İKDAM is "Employment Skills for Disabled People and Career Counseling Project" in which computer skills and masseuse trainings were delivered to disabled people. The aim of the project was to increase the employment prospects of disabled people and deliver seminars aiming at changing the negative attitude of employers towards employing disabled people.¹⁴

Trade chambers and employee-employer trade unions have been interested in activation programmes as institutions giving vocational training. TISK and TURK-IS implemented EU funded "Increasing Efficiency in Education and Employment Pilot Project" in the framework of MEGEP project carried out by MoNE in 2005. Again "Modernization of Vocational and Technical Education and Training (MTEM)" is among the projects carried out by TISK.¹⁵ Both employer and employee trade unions have been attaching great importance in vocational and technical education as they need qualified human resources and efficiency. On the other hand The Union of Chambers and Commodity Exchanges of

¹³ www.ikdam.ankara.edu.tr (Hakkımızda, Jan.20, 2010)

¹⁴ www.ikdam.ankara.edu.tr (Projeler, Jan.20, 2010)

¹⁵ www.tisk.org.tr (Projeler, Febr.03, 2010)

Turkey (TOBB) carries out important projects in vocational technical training. For instance, based on Pan-European system NACE, "Job Groupings Guide" has been prepared. This guide includes classifications on educational counseling and vocational guidance.¹⁶

The Chambers of Industry have introduced themselves in vocational training services in recent years by establishing their units of research and development and training foundations. A sample for those institutions which take over active responsibility to place successful graduates in labor market is Bursa The Foundation for Developing Education (BEGEV).¹⁷

Non governmental organizations are participating in the implementations of ALMP as institutions delivering trainings or as partners. Particularly women's associations take active participation in this topic and strive in the vocational training and entrepreneurship.

Besides, KAR-DER has undertaken the implementation of two international projects, which are successively called "Guidance Quality Measures for Job-Seekers in Group Settings- GUIDE ME!" (Austria-Turkey-Bulgaria-Lithuania-Greece-Poland) and "Developing and Delivering Innovative ICT Vocational Guidance Services-BIDANIS" (Austria-Romania-ISKUR).

There are private organizations delivering VET and counseling activities in Turkey. Vocational guidance and career counseling services are included in Human Resources Management trainings in these institutions. On the other hand, parallel with the developments in the world, social entrepreneurship and social responsibility projects have become prevalent in recent years. One of those projects is "Meslek Lisesi Memleket Meselesi (MLMM)" carried out by MONE and the foundation of KOC Group, which is one of the leading companies in Turkey. The project aims at supporting students in VET, providing internship opportunities and coaching. The project executes the modernization of

¹⁶ www.tobb.org.tr (Duyurular and Meslekler Gruplandırma Rehberi Jan.14. 2010)

¹⁷ www.begev.org.tr (ana sayfa, Febr.02, 2010)

vocational technical training and strengthening of infrastructure. The students are employed after graduation.¹⁸

1.3 Setting in which guidance measures are carried out in Turkey (either in single coaching, group coaching, group training etc.)

VET and career counseling services and ALMP implementations carried out by ISKUR are delivered in both individual and group setting. The number and choice of courses are determined according to the needs of the target group. Getting women to gain occupational skills and encouraging women to participate in labor market are adopted as the primary policy. Thus, the women are provided with entrepreneurship trainings, vocational courses and counseling services. The studies are particularly oriented around decreasing the number of women in informal sector and providing trainings for them.¹⁹ Accordingly disabled people and unemployed young people are important special groups. The demand for vocational courses has increased in recent years. The size of the course groups can vary regarding the features of spatial and technical infrastructure and the number of applying participants.

The importance and quality of interaction between instructors and participants is emphasized by participants in ALMP-1 New Opportunities Program (NOP), Evaluation Report.²⁰ In the courses, instructors usually have the opportunity to group coaching to trainees in addition to delivering technical information.

A study indicating that coaching activities are not provided in desired level in vocational courses shows that employers themselves inclined to give this service in their vocational training. As a matter of fact the results of Vocational Training Research in Enterprises dated 2007 illustrates that enterprises take over the responsibility of delivering vocational trainings to employees. 32% of total enterprises presents vocational guidance services or just vocational

¹⁸ www.meslekliyesimemleketmeselesi.com/tr-TR/MLMMNedir/Amac (MLMM Amaç, Febr.03,2010)

¹⁹ http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/Rapor_bulten/2009-2011_donemi_performans_programi.pdf (2009-2011 Dönemi Performans Raporu, Febr.14, 2010) pp.45-46

²⁰ Varcin et all. 2007

training and this ratio increases as the scale of firm gets higher (in the enterprises having more than 250 employees, this ratio is determined as 46,6%)²¹

1.4 Requested initial and further training of guidance staff in Turkey

It is not possible to give a standard job definition for instructors in vocational training courses in Turkey. Instructors can be selected according to their fields among teachers of vocational and technical schools and public training centers, and academicians. As a matter of fact, in ALMP-1 NOP, academicians delivered trainings in the projects that are held between University, Industry and Civil society organizations.²² The trainees believed that the tutors from Universities would raise their level of qualification more.

Doubtlessly, adult education has its own unique features. Therefore trainers should have the necessary information about this field as well as experience in adult education. On the other side, when it is taken into consideration from the point of the circumstances (unemployment, low qualification etc.) of trainees who are having vocational training, the presentation of an empathic approach by the instructors is important in the sense of setting up a healthy communication. Moreover, it may be hard for all trainees to understand the given information at the same level of comprehension, which makes heterogeneous groups in terms of education a problem in the courses. According to Huseyin Azmaz²³, ISKUR evaluates the features of tutorials mostly according to their knowledge and experiences presented in a CV that is prepared with a specific format. The institutions and corporations organizing the trainings are making preparations within the frame of technical specifications.²⁴ Furthermore, it is indicated that ISKUR has information about the performances

²¹ www.tuik.gov.tr (prehaber, Febr.03, 2010)

²² Varcin et all. 2007

²³ Expert interview Huseyin Azmaz, director in the dept. of Job Counseling and Vocational/Occupational Guidance, ISKUR, (date of interview, Jan.27, 2010).

²⁴ <http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/ETA/ihaleler/06%20E%c4%9fitim%20Hizmeti%20Sat%c4%b1nalma%20%c4%b0halesi.pdf> (Eđitim Hizmeti Alma Teknik Şartnamesi, Febr.09, 2010)

of most of the tutors they worked with. However, Azmaz emphasizes that although these regulations are quite new, ISKUR is successful in adapting and improving quickly and it will be more successful in process of time. To this end in-service trainings have been prioritized.

1.5 Requested quality certificates from the guidance institutions

A quality standard about VET and guidance has not been developed in Turkey yet. However, some institutions have been attempting to implement the ISO 9000 Quality management system and Total Quality Management (TQM). Within this scope, ISKUR has been qualified to get the TSE K-Q EN ISO 9001:2000 Quality Management Certificate.²⁵ Moreover, in the accession process to EU a variety of institutions in Turkey have applied to get Quality management Certificate or have been getting education on this subject. MONE has already started to implement TQM practices at Secondary Education Institutions. Despite the pursuits of standardization and quality, Dr. Metin Piskin²⁶ says "First of all, it is necessary to determine the standards of quality of these occupations in order to deliver vocational training and guidance activities in a healthy way". Dr. Piskin, adds: "It would be better to wait until Vocational Qualification Authority has completed its studies. Then Vocational Quality Standards and certificates can come into agenda". He stresses that there is a need for an upper organization to monitor the special qualifications and standards and authorize.

Upon mentioning "National Vocational Guidance System Project", Dr. Piskin says "There are problems in distribution of authority in this field, which can be solved by the leadership of a single institution." According to Piskin, though the Euroguidance service of ISKUR has set the basic criteria on this subject, these criteria have not been standardized yet.

²⁵ 2009-2011 performans programı raporu, p.58 (2009-2011 Report of Performance Programme, p.58)

²⁶ Expert interview Dr.Metin Piskin, lecturer on career guidance, in IKDAM, Ankara University (interview date Jan.27, 2010)

2 Quality programs in continuous and further group training in Turkey

According to Metin Piskin, preparation of programs compatible with the rapid developments in the field, development of the tests that are compatible with Turkish Culture, and the updating of the knowledge of tutors and counselors are necessary by an approach that considers the rapid change in the world and variety of occupations. Piskin states that the necessary infrastructure for group guidance has not been improved yet and emphasized that the standard education program could not be provided even at the countrywide universities.

Huseyin Azmaz from ISKUR indicates that the activities which are being performed within the framework of EU acquis would ensure transition to high-quality programs in a short time, and states that there is not a specific quality certificate on an institutional basis yet. Azmaz, emphasizes that the quality of an education center and programme depend on the quality of the trainers they work with and therefore ISKUR is working with the best trainers. Trainers' knowledge, skills, and experience are examined in detail according to the criteria of the specifications.

The fact that quality programs cover the industry area mostly leads the service provider institutions to settle with the current programs in their search for quality management systems. Especially the search for quality in the field of vocational training and guidance paved the way for the transfer of this kind of service. Indeed KAR-DER has been implementing "Guidance Quality Measures for Job-Seekers in Group Settings-GUIDE ME! Project" (Austria-Turkey-Bulgaria-Greece-Lithuania-Poland) with the partnership of various institutions and organizations across Europe. This application is considered to be an important step for the elimination of the deficit in this area.

3 Quality situation in guidance in group settings in Turkey

In addition to ISKUR and MONE operating on the subject of vocational training and the guidance, non-governmental organizations and local governments are working in this area. The institutions, the trainers, and the

trainees/participants that work in an activity of vocational training and group guidance create a threefold.

To determine the current situation, it is necessary to know the quality of given educations, performances of training institutions/organizations and trainers, the views of trainers about trainees/participants, and the evaluations of trainees/participants about the Quality of trainers. ISKUR has been evaluating both the pre-training and post-training situation to determine the participation of trainees in labor market. These outputs are necessary to raise quality in delivering services. However there is uncertainty through what criteria the outputs will be determined and evaluated. One of the studies which gives an overview of the current situation is ALMP-1 New Opportunities Program (NOP): Evaluation Report 2007²⁷ and the other is Technical Assistance to the EC Delegation in Ankara for Monitoring the Implementation of Active Labor Market Measures Grant Scheme, Final Report 2009.²⁸

ALMP-1:NOP is the first activation program that is executed by ISKUR in Turkey. The program was successful even though it was the first time both ISKUR and the education institutions and organizations (grant beneficiaries) were involved in such programme. There are public and private sector representatives, universities, foundations, local governments and chambers among the participants of the grant program. There were participations from many regions of Turkey and various vocational and development courses were conducted. Both grant beneficiaries and the trainees have expressed their high satisfactions. A few negative opinions about the program were highlighted in the report:²⁹

²⁷ Varcin et all. 2007

²⁸ Varcin, Recep, Dayiođlu, Ceyda and Sayan, Levent, Technical Assistance to the EC Delegation in Ankara for Monitoring the Implementantation of Active Labour Market Measures Grant Scheme, Final Report 2009 (unpublished document).

²⁹ Varcin, et all, 2009 p.39-45

According to findings, only 34.4% of 10,880 participants were employed. Although it is not the desired result, such a result is not too bad for a program carried out for the first time. One of the problems emerged in the courses which have not chosen the right target groups. The trainees stated that a training that is given in a heterogeneous group in terms of education and qualification level is another reason for not achieving the desired performance. Secondly, although there was a very high level of satisfaction from instructors, the participants expressed their dissatisfaction of some trainers (9.3%). Low educated and low skilled young people expressed their content with the trainers who were academicians.

The trainers who are not academicians but experienced and expert in his/her field had high success rates. The feedback to career guidance and counseling services was not as high as expected (54.5%). In this respect, the trainees stressed that the technical and vocational trainings were satisfactory, but only a few instructors answered their questions about their career and future. On the other hand course duration is mentioned as being very short. The total rate of the trainees who made negative reviews about the quality of given education is 34.7%. (31,7% partly qualified; 3% Unqualified).

There are also negative assessments in the 2009 Final Report such as the long training program, courses taking place in summer season, unofficial certificates and not believing to be employed after the project. 26% of training institutions stated that they had problems with the target group. It has been criticized that there was not a specific and single procedure in selecting the target groups and that the procedure changed from one region to another and from one province to another. And it is emphasized that it was difficult to reach out target group of women. ISKUR was asked to address to the women in the training announcements. As a positive assessment, it was found out that training, career and psychological counseling services raised the motivation of the trainees.³⁰

³⁰ Varcin, et all. 2009, p.19-20.

3.1 Existing problems on the system and meta level

The main problem of the system is the absence of standardization of vocational training and group setting guidance. In order to deliver standardized trainings it is necessary to define occupational definitions, required education level and the required individuals' qualifications. It is difficult to find standardized education even at universities. Nevertheless, private sector, chambers and associations pay importance on advanced technology, design, and innovation in vocational training as well as career management, counseling, and coaching services. But training services need to be developed.

Foundations aiming at developing VET like BEGEV³¹ carries out courses such as CAD, CAM, mechatronic, textile, design, etc which answer local needs. While these institutions transfer technology from abroad, they also import technical instructors to deliver trainings and provide quality in training. These trainings lead to update knowledge of both trainees and Turkish instructors who train them.

The troubles training institutions have been experiencing in vocational training and guidance in group settings are listed in Turkish Country Report³² as follows:

In the services implemented by MONE:

- Mindset and environment to develop individual qualities are not adequately constituted.
- Co-operation relationship between institutions and units is completely established.
- Vocational Qualifications are not set and there is not organized and sufficient documentary pool.

³¹ www.begev.org.tr (kurslar, Febr.09, 2010)

³² Fusun Akkök: 2006, 44-47.

- Vocational information and guidance is not varied and flexible according to the sort of and the specialty of training.
- Psychological measurement instruments are not sufficient and institutionalization is weak.
- RAMs have many shortcomings such as equipments, experts and physical space.
- There is insufficiency in the given knowledge and skill level of instructors. Furthermore there is a gap in terms of the number of instructors.
- Turkey is a big country with many regional differences, which makes regulation process more complex and slower.³³

The problems in terms of ISKUR are listed below:

- Compared with the job counseling services, vocational counseling services are implemented mostly.
- Whereas ISKUR has recently recruited experts, it could not completely meet the need for specialists.
- The use of ICT in guidance is not sufficient.³⁴

According to Turkish Psychological Counseling and Guidance Association (PDR-DER)³⁵;

- New areas of occupation and job have been emerging; however the number of the instructors who give training for those jobs does not increase with the same speed.

³³ Metin Pişkin. "İlk ve Ortaöğretim Öğrencilerinin Kariyer Gelişimleri ve Yönlendirme Süreçlerinde Gözlenen Sorunlar ve Çözüm Önerileri", Turk Eğitim Sisteminde Paradigma Arayışları. Eğitim-Bir-Sen, Ankara (Turkey), 2007, p.24.

³⁴ Akkök, 2006, p.46-47

³⁵ www.pdr.org.tr/upload/dernek tarihi.pdf (Turk Psikolojik Danışma ve Rehberlik Derneği'nin Tarihiçesi, Febr.03, 2010)

- There is a need for instructors who adopt lifelong learning principles and has the ability to adapt themselves to constant changes in labor market.
- The quantity in training is valued more than the quality. To increase the number of trainees and training courses accordingly is thought to be more important than increasing the quality of the services. However, the quality of the trainings should be more important.
- The international standards of occupations and jobs have been constituted, but these arrangements have not been completed in Turkey.
- It is essential to deliver vocational trainings by using the latest technologies. This requires to follow the rapid technological change and frequently to update the given technology despite its costs, which is a shortcoming in system as well.

The level of success of vocational training courses is very important. One of the indicators of success is the quantity of trainees employed after completing the courses. The results of ALMP-1 social impact research indicate that the employment level is low after completing employment guaranteed vocational courses. Even the percent of employment is low, it is necessary to define causes behind it and to prevent it happening again. One of the problems at this point is to follow the duration that individuals remain in employment. In the statistics bulletin of ISKUR in January 2009-2010, when compared the data of January 2009 with that of January 2010, it has been seen that the ratio of job placement has increased 65, 73%.³⁶

The problems women have in employment have lead to development of ALMP-2 specifically for women. Another group under risk is disabled people. Even though this group is provided with various vocational courses, still their participation in employment remains limited. Thus, trainings were delivered to employers to remove their prejudice against employing disabled people. The

³⁶ <http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/ark/ark/ocak.htm> (Ocak 2010 İstatistik Bülteni, Febr.09, 2010)

positive results of these efforts have been observed even a little bit. For example, when compared the data of January 2009 to the data of January 2010, it is seen that employment rate of disabled people has increased 26, 59%.³⁷

In terms of instructors delivering vocational trainings, there is not a specific research. Civil servant instructors receive standardized payments for trainings; nonetheless, chambers, foundations and associations are flexible to pay much more. The working hours and number of courses of instructors is defined according to certain rules. But it could be said that the density of courses affects the performance of instructors and the quality of courses in a negative way.

There may be communication problem of instructors with different actors within the program – trainees, managers, other instructors, etc. Even though in ALMP-1 social impact research it is stated that the communication between actors are mostly positive, it is known that there sometimes emerges trouble.³⁸

At the interview with Metin Piskin, he stated that there are huge differences in the quality of education in this field between well-known and old universities and newly established provincial universities. The newly established provincial universities do not have a standardized qualified education which results in graduates who are not qualified enough in guidance and counseling.

Among the problems stated by trainees it is striking that they do not believe that they will be employed after the courses and they do not trust the validity of the certificates they receive. The trainees especially have a high expectation of courses in EU funded programmes. They expect to receive certificates at diploma level. However those certificates are just proving their

³⁷ <http://statik.iskur.gov.tr> (Ocak 2010 İstatistik Bülteni, Febr.09, 2010)

³⁸ Varcin et. all, 2007

participation in such training courses. Metin Piskin and Huseyin Azmaz from ISKUR point out that there is no senior authority to approve those certificates.

3.2 Suggestions by experts to improve the situation or solve the problems

Turkey has been endeavoring to solve the problems in vocational training and group setting guidance. It is particularly trying to keep up with the rapid changes in the world. Therefore, the changes in the field of vocational training and group setting guidance should be followed as well.

It has been widely discussed in Turkey the transition from traditional vocational guidance model to “comprehensive progressive vocational guidance model”. This model is criticized because of the fact that it is oriented towards groups and ignores individual characteristics and orientations.³⁹ Dr. Piskin states that we need vocational guidance services relevant to the pace of social development and instructors should be not only informed but also be experienced and be aware of the psychological approaches. In this respect standardization and accreditation should be achieved in training programs. Tailored programmes should be developed for special groups under risk. According to Piskin, guidance in group setting should be of great importance and the participants should be considered within their social group by the means of use of technology, internet, e-mail, groups of social communication. It is important in such an issue to know ethic and legislation so as to observe the efficiency of presented services and to get feedback and evaluate. Another topic that should be taken care of according to Piskin is that multicultural vocational guidance should be practiced. It should be the main principle that discourses are not discriminating against race, belief, status, gender, and class position in the field of vocational information and guidance.

Huseyin Azmaz from ISKUR states that ISKUR has been developing infrastructure to carry out vocational guidance services in virtual environment. According to Azmaz the supervision of instructors is important. Instructors’

³⁹ Pişkin, 2006.

abilities, demands, and expectations should be determined in order to make up the deficiencies and to develop present potentials. Azmaz focuses on the importance of co-operation between ISKUR and training institutions, and expresses that working in cooperation increases the performance of partners in the framework of openness/transparency principle.

The fact that instructors randomly search for knowledge in internet can lead them to run across non-scientific information and approaches.⁴⁰ Therefore, in-service training of instructors and groups should not be neglected.

Azmaz mentioned about the significance of trainees' obtaining information about instruments used, the period of courses, and curriculum before courses begin and added that they were trying to develop the concept of "modular course".

In the ALMP-1 NOP: Evaluation Report, there are feedbacks from trainees regarding the communication, collaboration, co-operation between ISKUR and training institutions and also performance of instructors(see, pp. 14-15). It is crucial that such evaluation reports related to the current situation of systems should be prepared. These reports are guides to improve the system and solve the problems.

4 Existing quality standards in guidance in group settings

ISKUR has been implementing the vocational courses in cooperation with different training institutions. "Technical Specification of Procurement of Training Services" document prepared by ISKUR includes the criteria regarding the selection procedure of training institutions, target groups, selection of trainers, qualification of trainers and their previous performance, the course duration and etc. Some of the criteria are stated in the document are as follows:⁴¹

⁴⁰ Fidan Korkut: 2007, 193-194.

⁴¹ <http://statik.iskur.gov.tr/tr/ETA/ihaleler/06%20E%c4%9fitim%20Hizmeti%20Sat%c4%b1nalma%20%c4%b0halesi.pdf> (Eđitim Hizmeti Alma Teknik Őartnamesi, Febr.09, 2010)

- Identification and selection of the target group,
- The objectives of the target group,
- The duration of courses and daily hours of the courses,
- The qualifications of instructors, their experience and proficiency,
- Training materials to be used during the course,
- Technical equipment to be used during the course (course setting technical equipment, premises etc)
- Determining the general quality of the course.

The trainees are provided with Self-development and career choices information as well as vocational guidance services. Metin Piskin points out that these services increases the quality in the activities of vocational guidance.

4.1 Quality certificates used in the Turkey

Quality certificates in Turkey are given by Turkish Standards Institution (TSE). An impartial third party authority is selected to determine the quality of products and services. TS-EN-ISO 9000, 90001 The Quality Management Systems, and TQM are the instruments commonly used in Turkey. It is aimed to ensure quality from the stage of design to the last stage of product or service.⁴²

4.2 Quality efforts or individual quality programs by the initiators, training institutions or trainers' organizations

The efforts to develop quality in vocational training and guidance unfortunately remain as individual efforts of the institutions. As it is emphasized in this report, there are many constructive samples all of which tend to increase the quality of the system. The first and foremost study in the effort of developing

⁴² www.tse.org.tr/Turkish/kaliteyönetimi/9000bilgi.asp (TS EN ISO 9000: Kalite Yönetim Sistemi/Genel Bilgilendirme, Febr.03, 2010)

quality should be to identify occupational standards. Turkey has stepped forward in the matter of occupational standards. The relevant institutions have co-operated in the constitution of occupational standards by centering their efforts upon this standardization.

On the other side, it is creditable for training institutions to develop their own quality. The motivation created by the accession process to EU leads fairly to the metamorphosis of institutions concerning the institutional development and quality certificates.

5 Important quality domains in scope of guidance measures with regards to the specific problems in Turkey

As a result it can be said that the activities of vocational training and guidance exhibit a constantly growth trend; however, it has been asserted in this report that there are some problems:

In respect of the courses, it is necessary that the occupational information and technologies should be updated, new occupations should be promoted and placed in training programs, and training materials should be updated and comprehensible.

In respect of instructors, the quality of instructors should be improved. It should be ensured that the instructors are emphatic and sensitive with regard to self development and also take care of individual needs of trainees. An instructor has to be intelligent, innovative, creative, and experienced. Besides, he/she should be able to encourage trainees to have such qualities. Consequently, it is important that the communication between instructor and trainees is open. It is essential that instructors have plausible work-load and be made payment appropriate to that burden.

In respect of trainees, it is important that the homogeneity of the groups in courses is provided, the validity of certificates given to trainees is ensured, approaches constraining the behaviors of trainees during courses is avoided, information concerning the expectations of career and future delivered.

In respect of institutions giving training, the most important problem is to reach right target groups and to choose right trainees. Ensuring cooperation with stakeholders in organizing the courses leads to right selection of target group and successful trainings.

In respect of ISKUR, it is important to learn from experiences, to give feedback regularly, to provide guidance just in time and to ensure institutional development.